

BOOK REVIEWS SECTION

Jon Barnett & John Campbell (2010) *Climate Change and Small Island States: Power, Knowledge and the South Pacific*, London, Earthscan, 218pp. ISBN: 978-1-84407-494-5. £49.99

Small Island Developing States (SIDS) are highly concerned about the possible impacts of climate change on their countries, communities, and people. That includes the South Pacific SIDS, amongst which are several, low-lying atolls that have sparked a debate regarding the potential need to evacuate entire countries due to climate change.

Climate Change and Small Island States aims to examine how science and policy connect, interact, and do not connect with respect to climate change and small island states, using the South Pacific as a case study. The mandate is providing information about climate change's challenges for the case study area plus analysis of how the challenges are represented and responded to, including barriers to appropriate strategies for tackling the challenges.

The book has nine chapters. The first chapter introduces climate change and the South Pacific region. Chapter 2 provides some more details about the islands and island societies, covering aspects of the environment, development, and history. The next five chapters attempt an overview and critical analysis of Pacific climate-related science, policy, and practice. They discuss some international approaches and their relevance to the Pacific along with some Pacific-specific initiatives, focusing on the regional level. Critiques are provided through specific and detailed examples. A recurrent theme is the power disparity between who decides the science, policies, and actions to pursue and what Pacific islanders would prefer.

Chapter 8 tries to consolidate some of the material that has been presented into "Discourses of Danger" (the chapter's title). The focus is on what is often assumed to be island characteristics, such as small size and isolation, leading into aspects of vulnerability which are then interpreted in the context of the populist topics of "Titanic states" and "climate refugees".

The conclusions in Chapter 9 summarise three themes that the authors put forward: different knowledge types, different approaches to responding to climate change, and discussing the separateness and speciality of a climate-focused approach. The chapter and book then conclude with some generalities regarding how Pacific islands could potentially deal with climate change's challenges.

The authors picked an important and relevant theme, define the problem clearly and sensibly, and provide a useful structure for approaching and trying to deal with the identified problem. In implementing the research and analysis to provide the evidence and discussion within the book, difficulties emerge.

In particular, the review and understanding of the literature is limited. For instance, the book rightly examines ideas and ideals of islands and islandness within the understanding and perception of climate change: an “island-centric framing” (p. 49). Yet there is minimal mention of the island studies literature while principal authors who founded and continue to advance this field of study are absent from the book.

Similarly, some essential historical documents regarding sea-level rise and the Pacific are presented and appropriately discussed. Conversely, James Lewis’ pioneering work on this topic in the Pacific is entirely missing as is reference to the crucial 1989 conference in the Maldives that helped to set the small island agenda for sea-level rise, despite presentations there from several Pacific representatives.

Naturally, no volume can ever be comprehensive in its referencing. The key is for authors to provide a balance of references to ensure that analyses are not skewed by the literature selected. Alternatively, authors are free to admit certain biases and to explicitly accept a specific framework to narrow a book’s scope, indicating what they leave out. *Climate Change and Small Island States* does neither.

That leads to inadequate interpretations and contextualizations. The media’s obsession with “sinking” islands is rightly criticised, but not from a scientific perspective that the islands are not often sinking *per se* but might stay where they are, as sea level rises above them. Furthermore, key publications showing the lack of empirical evidence for islands disappearing through inundation are not cited.

As another example, considering the vast literature on low-carbon development pathways, it is unclear why the authors suggest that there is “considerable logic” (p. 95) in some countries’ stance that carbon dioxide emissions limits would inhibit their development. The authors also correctly tackle the “climate refugees” discourse, but could have referenced Betsy Hartmann’s cutting-edge work on this topic that explains why the paradigm gains traction, thereby giving the book’s commentary some depth and scientific backing.

The authors state that little recognition is given to what islanders can do and are doing for themselves regarding dealing with climate change. They accept that plenty of internal responses exist, but they explicitly do not describe many—thereby perpetuating the poor recognition of them. These omissions are justified by stating “we do not have enough experience with them to comment: [sic] they are not well documented; and they are best assessed by those people associated with them” (p. 112). Yet plenty of examples have been documented and published, such as work across the Pacific by Eileen Shea and others at the East-West Center who have spent much of their careers doing and writing about exactly these tasks with Pacific islander perspectives. As another example from amongst many, Samoa developed coastal management plans through extensive local consultations, which was published in 2008.

Cherry picking the literature is exemplified by the discussion of vulnerability in an island context. Claims are made that vulnerability discourse is simplistic, “mask[ing] the

heterogeneity of island environments and of their social systems” (p. 21) and not factoring in the unrealistic “negativism associated with...the so-called problems of smallness and isolation” (p. 159). These statements, and the sections describing vulnerability to climate change as a product of social context, are fair comments on some of the literature cited in the book. Yet they neglect the decades-long vulnerability literature which defines vulnerability as being contextual and which frequently uses island examples to show the diversity of environments, societies, and vulnerabilities which exist. That literature also details the inspiring diversity of responses to vulnerabilities, especially from local knowledge on the affected people’s terms.

Consequently, the book is founded on strawman arguments that are defended based on a selective reading of the literature. The views presented in the book have merit, and many of the criticisms are apt for the material provided. Much more to the picture exists that was available to the authors in terms of depth, balance, and nuancing.

Overall, *Climate Change and Small Island States* does not do justice to a topic that might define the future of many of the peoples and countries covered in the book. The authors’ hearts are in the right place, being empathetic towards and wishing to help those who will suffer due to climate change through little fault of their own. The research and analysis do not match that.

Ilan Kelman

Center for International Climate and Environmental Research (CICERO)

Oslo, Norway

islandvulnerability[at]yahoo.com

AND

Jon Barnett and John Campbell have mapped the landscape of climate change science and policy in the Pacific with a focus on issues of knowledge, equity and power. The book represents a novel advance in our understanding of climate change as a socio-ecological issue, and is pitched to appeal to a broad audience - scientists, social scientists and practitioners alike. Crucial is the book’s concern with people and power. It offers a critical intervention into climate change debates dominated by ecological modernization’s technocentrism, demonstrating convincingly that the ‘vulnerable’ populations of the Pacific are often denied agency on climate change issues, and that the local and culturally specific imperatives of adaptation tend to be subsumed in the globalized and homogenizing discourse of much climate change research and policy.

In Chapter One, the authors articulate their twofold aim for the book. Firstly, to provide information on problems of climate change in Pacific Islands, including existing and possible responses. Secondly, to analyze representations of climate change in the Pacific, and ways in which these representations constrain responses. Chapters Two through Five provide a thorough overview and critique – strongly informed by post-colonial theories - of Pacific environment and development, climate science and climate policy. In Chapter Six, a range of climate change projects are documented. The success of those that are local,

inexpensive, field-based, focused on adaptation, and driven by internal actors (rather than outside ‘experts’) is noted. Chapter Seven explores contested science and its politicization among researchers, donors and island leaders in the context of two controversial projects, the South Pacific Sea Level and Climate Monitoring project and the Environmental Vulnerability Index. The first is critiqued as an attempt by the Australian government to increase rather than decrease uncertainty about sea level rise - a questionable interpretation of data which suited its political agenda. The second is explained as science with a poor methodology producing unacceptable, contradictory measures of environmental vulnerability of nation-states that would be inequitable if used as a basis for allocating funding. The book ends with an examination of the problematic practice of appropriating ‘sinking island’ tropes for purposes (such as selling news) that are far removed from, and often work against, advancing the adaptation imperatives of the inhabitant populations.

If we consider both of the authors’ stated aims as stand-alone goals, the book certainly achieves what it sets out to do. The reader is provided with access to well-organized information on the complex network of knowledge, institutions, interests and narratives that shape climate change as a socio-ecological issue in the Pacific. There is, however, a certain tension running throughout the book between the aims of firstly, providing information about climate change; and secondly, critiquing representations thereof. At issue is the authors’ adoption of a rather positivist register with which to report on their post-structural analysis. While this epistemological entanglement in part offers a useful way to reach actors in the ‘big science’ that dominates climate change activity in the Pacific, self-reflection on the authors’ own positionality in climate change research is lacking. The effect is that the book becomes a reproduction, in parts, of the very same, distanced, ‘all-seeing expert’ discourses which the authors carefully critique.

Moreover, the lack of a significant volume of documented climate change activity at the local level does not help matters. The authors, of course, are unable to do much about this gap. Nevertheless, the fact remains – and this is perhaps the book’s main weakness – that a lack of Pacific people’s agency in climate change research and policy is clearly identified but not satisfactorily addressed. Tantalizingly gestured to throughout, but frustratingly only touched on, are alternative discourses with which a more meaningful adaptation debate might be advanced. Epele Hau’ofa’s classic call for understanding the Pacific as a *sea of islands*, pointing out the central role of ocean and migration, is usefully referenced. But other Pacific conceptualizations and experiences of ocean and island ways of being are absent. A prominent example that is ripe for attention by researchers interested in culturally meaningful climate change engagement is the revival of sailing and navigational knowledge (starting with the Pacific Voyaging Society in Hawai’i). Voyages of double-hulled canoes are now being mobilized in the name of environmental awareness across the Pacific, and have been important in strengthening cultural pride and identity. The discourses through which these voyages are promoted arguably provide concepts alternative to the victim discourse of ‘climate refugees’. Furthermore, concepts such as *vanua* (in Fiji, land as extension of self and self as extension of land) and *fenua* (in Tuvalu and elsewhere in Polynesia, an island and the community of that island) are important for understanding links between community and place. These have been documented – albeit

not often with climate change in mind - in anthropology and cultural studies, and could have been fruitfully explored more deeply in this volume.

Despite the absence of Pacific discourses, the book presents a skilful negotiation of climate change power relations. The right of vulnerable populations to agency in climate adaptation without being subject to the practice of ‘blaming the victim’, for instance, is capably argued. Intra-community power relations are perhaps the key area dealt with less than satisfactorily: some important issues at the intersection of culture, adaptation and power at this scale remain unexplored. An example is Chapter One’s identification of different adaptive capacities to flood among households in Fijian villages because the elevation of *yavu* (house mounds) is directly proportional to social status. The authors argue that adaptation needs to be “... consistent with the social and cultural mores particular to the community in which adaptation takes place” (p. 17). Yet, the conditions under which this unevenly distributed adaptive capacity within a village might be either maintained or changed remain unpacked. A more power-savvy conceptualization of culturally meaningful adaptation would have been useful here.

Overall, however, what Barnett and Campbell have clearly demonstrated is that there is much more work to be done in the field of critical, transdisciplinary climate change studies in the Pacific (and elsewhere). They have shown what is needed: more attention to documenting the unfolding community-based adaptation work that is being done by government agencies, community groups and NGOs; listening more closely to the voices of people in the Pacific; and fostering an appreciation of rich, culturally nuanced understandings of how climate change is embedded in everyday life. This contribution does much to advance our understanding of, and promote an agenda for, interdisciplinary, culturally meaningful research and policy that centralizes the agency of those deemed and defined as ‘vulnerable’ to climate change.

Carol Farbotko

University of Wollongong, Australia

carolf@uow.edu.au

Sabine Hess (2009) *Person and Place: Ideas, Ideals and the Practice of Sociality on Vanua Lava, Vanuatu*, New York and Oxford, Berghahn, hardback, 252pp, 23 ills, 2 maps, 13 tables, 8 figs, ISBN 978-1-84545-599-6. US\$95.00/£58.00.

This monograph is the first case study of a whole (future) series that aims at focussing on “the local [...] as the realm of experience where different influences meet” (p. ix). Fleshing out this rather vague project in the light of contemporary theory, the book ventures out to include the notion of gendered places in a Strathernian model of fractional/shared personhood. Based on intensive fieldwork on a Northern Vanuatu island and close co-operation with ‘papa’ Eli Field, a local *kastom* authority, the thick description of events from the author’s point of view and the detailed lists, diagrams and tables from Eli’s *kastom* perspective combine in creating a valuable ethnography.

The book begins with a discussion of relational kinship in the form of matrilineal moieties and clans as well as in terms of a discursive way of emphasizing notions of belonging to a place. Local adoption practices leave no doubt that kinship goes well beyond genetic 'blood' relations: not surprising for scholars of Oceania who have long agreed to Silverman's famous expression that "mud is stronger than blood" (1971:72ff). The second chapter outlines Hess' theoretical take on Marilyn Strathern and others who have argued that the Western notion of individualism is not universal. While agreeing with the principle of a shared group identity (dividuality) at the heart of Melanesian concepts of personhood, Hess argues that embodiment, emplacement, and indeed practice and habitus need to be taken seriously in order to find both shared and individual elements in the local understanding of personhood. This is a laudable approach as it allows her to include moralities, sentiments, gift-giving, empathy and relationships of respect/power, drawing images of flexibility and autonomy. Persons and places, so her leading argument, cannot be 'thought of' separately.

The third chapter describes life cycle events, focussing on constructions of relatedness in terms of food distribution and consumption at weddings and funerals. Food is central as a metaphor (and creator) of kinship and belonging, and the food that is exchanged at life-cycle events is a good example for shared group affiliation: "by consuming foreign food, one can acquire qualities of foreign places" (p. 104).

In the fourth chapter, the local concept of place is presented as a complex habitus which the researcher needed to learn as it differed from her Western practice (which she needed to un-learn). Time and place are intrinsically social and connected: "in people's thought time and place occupy the same space" (p. 110). Place names are intimately linked to persons; and knowledge of stories about persons, places, and times are evidence of land rights. This chapter covers a large territory, from categories of land and appropriate motion in place; to principles of heritage, emplaced spiritual powers, politics of knowing, and gendered metaphors of place. Perhaps too many aspects were crammed into only 30 pages, as this chapter left me with open questions. Is there any difference in the way we (Westerners) feel emotionally attached to places (p. 135)? Was there really more mobility for everyone in the past, when people had seagoing canoes (p. 137)? This chapter would have benefited from some sketch maps and the inclusion of statements by town-dwelling islanders.

The fifth chapter is based on a well-presented case study of land dispute. Using Lindstrom's distinction between disciplines (what is true?) and doctrines (what is right?), Hess argues convincingly that various discursive strategies are combined in public oratory. By evoking the authority of *kastom*, of Christianity, and – nowadays – of 'fieldworker talk', speakers attempt to convince the others of their justified position in the conflict.

The "two sides of the same stone", *kastom* and Church, are discussed in more detail in Chapter Six. By focussing on the Anglican denomination, with some mention of SDA, Hess argues with the islanders that "*kastom* and Church are the same" (p. 159) while also pointing out some key differences in terms of place and personhood. Christianity can be seen as *kastom* from another place; engaging in both *kastom* and Church shapes the

people's doctrine as Hess demonstrates with data on models of the afterworld(s) and the transformation from a corpse to a spirit. By comparing the local forms of leadership, she places both *kastom* and Church in the realm of practice and emplaced relationships. Fear, she quotes Eli, keeps people under control: both chiefs and Church leaders operate on the background of people's fear of spells, ghosts, and God (p. 185). Magic and prayer are not so far apart when seen from this perspective.

In her brief conclusion, Hess focuses on the different forces that have influenced the island in the past. Both changes and continuity are present: *kastom* and various modernities have been transformed while at the same time transforming island life, local moralities, and senses of place and personhood. The flexibility of doctrines in the light of habitus and practice appears as a challenge to the anthropologist; but this book demonstrates that it is possible to tackle the challenge by flexibly shifting from their point of view to one's own.

The monograph is presented in an easily accessible prose, with key questions at the beginning of each chapter and a summary at its end. By including many terms in vernacular(s) and Bislama, Hess demonstrates her detailed knowledge, but a glossary would have been useful in the light of so many words in three languages. I am not convinced by her decision to mark these terms in bold: they jump out of the page while not providing meaning. Theoretically, the book is a valuable contribution to the debate on personhood and location. While reading, I often wondered why the author had not made use of Margaret Rodman's useful discussion of multivocality and multilocality, but the focus on 'person' rather than 'place' may have led to this omission.

I recommend this book to scholars of Oceania for its dense ethnography as well as to anyone who is interested in personhood, dynamics of change, and, of course, senses of place.

Susanne Kuehling
University of Regina
Saskatchewan, Canada
Susanne.Kuehling@uregina.ca

Julie Duchaine, Holly Hughes, Alexis Lipsitz Flippin & Sylvie Murphy (2010) *Frommer's 500 Extraordinary Islands*, Hoboken NJ, Wiley, x+533pp, ISBN: 978-047050070-5. US\$19.99.

This is a useful and engaging book well worth purchasing for anyone either looking for inspiration for an island getaway or simply wishing to explore some of the world's islands from the comfort of an armchair. The book is organized thematically, under eleven tantalizing headings: Beachcomber Islands, Garden Islands, Wildlife Islands, Island Escapes, Treasure Islands, Pleasure Islands, Leisure Islands, Islands of History, Islands of Mystery, Island Cities, City Islands, Island Nations, and Ends of the Earth. Each of these divisions has several subdivisions. For example, 'Islands of History' includes some chapters on Pirate Islands; while 'Islands of Mystery' carries some chapters on Spiritual

Centres. A typical entry in the book is just over one page, and contains several paragraphs describing the particular island and its main attractions, a link for the best tourist information site about the island, the location of the nearest airport, recommendations of one or two hotels, and details about a tour company that operates on the island. About one third of the entries are illustrated with a black-and-white photograph.

Not all of the 500 islands receive the full one-page description. The book contains 23 “Island Hopping” sections which are usually two-page spreads devoted to the islands of an archipelago (such as the Galápagos, the Seychelles, and the Lofoten Islands), and each of these sections includes several islands that count towards the total of 500. The book has both alphabetical and geographical indices, and a world map is divided between the inside covers of the book—but this map is essentially useless as it does not indicate the locations of most of the islands discussed.

To convey the most important and appealing aspects of an island in one page is no easy task, and some of the entries are less successful than others. The chapter on Oahu in Hawai’i (pp. 50-51) says nothing about the beautiful interior of the island; the chapter on Sumatra (pp. 204-205) does not effectively convey the reasons for visiting the island; the single page on island hopping in Dalmatia (p. 331) simply does not do the archipelago justice; and the chapter on Cuba (pp. 385-386) gives too much information about the island’s history and not enough about things to do there. One also wishes that the authors would more consistently indicate the best time to visit each island: a key issue, especially beyond the tropics. And the text contains some typographical errors that should have been caught by the proof reader before the book went to press.

Yet, in general, the quality of the chapters is high, and they are clearly superior—more detailed, and conveying broader information about the destinations—to those in a very successful book which one suspects provided some inspiration to the publishers, namely Patricia Schultz’s *1000 Places To See Before You Die* (New York: Workman, 2003). The text is also superior to that in Steve Davey and Marc Schlossman’s *Unforgettable Islands to Escape to Before You Die* (Richmond Hill, Ontario: Firefly Books, 2007), and to that in Charles Arnold’s *Mediterranean Islands: A Unique and Comprehensive Guide to the Islands and Islets of the Mediterranean* (London: Mediterranean Islands, 2008), which was reviewed in *Island Studies Journal*, vol. 3, no. 2.

The great virtue of *500 Extraordinary Islands* is that reading it is like exploring the world: its pages address a great variety of destinations, and even those who have read widely about islands are certain to find some that are new to them. There are islands for scuba diving, birding meccas, holy islands, party islands, prison islands, islands with remarkable ecosystems, museum islands, and so on. The book is highly recommended.

Chet Van Duzer
Los Altos Hills
California, USA
chetv@aol.com

Davide Bigalli (2010) *Il Mito della Terra Perduta: Da Atlantide a Thule*, [The Myth of the Lost Land: From Atlantis to Thule], Milan and Rome, Italy, Bevivino, 206pp + notes and index. Softcover. ISBN: 978-889592348-2. €20.00.

Davide Bigalli is professor of the history of philosophy at the University of Milan, Italy. In this book, he adopts the “history of ideas” approach developed by Arthur O. Lovejoy in order to illustrate and comment upon various Western myths that had, at their core, the idea of a ‘lost land’ that had to be retrieved and repossessed in order for people to achieve material or spiritual benefits.

The book, written in Italian, is divided in three parts. Each part might have benefited from a more extensive discussion, and indeed perhaps a separate publication.

Part One, “The Route from Atlantis to Paradise”, starts by introducing the Atlantis myth in its original formulation by the ancient Greek philosopher Plato. It is the story of a great Atlantic island inhabited by an advanced civilization which controlled a large empire. The armies of Atlantis failed in their attempt to conquer Greece, and the island’s political customs degenerated to such an extent that they provoked Zeus’ anger. The enraged god destroyed the island with earthquakes. In that sense, this myth has at its core the description of a world that weighed menacingly on early humankind. Bigalli then provides several further versions of the same myth, elaborated within the Hellenic and Hebrew worlds, and also by some early Christian writers. The author introduces a series of texts, above all literary ones (e.g. *Vita Sancti Brendani*, *The Divine Comedy*, *Orlando Furioso*), that re-launched the myth of a lost land but with a connotation opposite to that of Atlantis: that of heaven on earth: Eden as a natural state of happiness and perfection to which humankind wishes to revert, through both a “eschatological” process linked to the final events of the human history and of individual soul salvation.

The second part of the book, “New World and New Atlantis”, is the most extensive, best reasoned, and probably the most interesting. Here, the author tries to pinpoint the presence of myths deriving from Atlantis and Eden (separately, or with various interweaves) within the historical, geographical, philosophical, and theological documents about the Atlantic explorations that began during the Renaissance. Bigalli shows how the different versions and interpretations of these myths (such as those underlying the insular or the continental character of Atlantis; or those identifying Atlantis with the newly discovered continent of America, which was initially thought to be an island) helped to create specific geopolitical visions, including the justification for certain European nations to conquer the American lands. In several versions of these myths, one can see different attitudes regarding the relationships to be established with the inhabitants of the New World. These include a romantic approach to presumed “edenic” indigenous customs, a benign paternalism rooted in a presumed superiority of Western civilization, and brazen racism. In this part of the book, some utopian-oriented elaborations of the Atlantis myth (like that in Francis Bacon’s *New Atlantis* in the 17th century) are discussed, together with other elaborations, like those of such authors as the 18th century astronomer Jean-Sylvain Bailly who sought to “locate”

the Atlantis myth in several other distant places, ranging from the Indian Ocean to the polar regions. The key motive for some of these latter relocations was to identify the native land of humankind, and above all the origins of wisdom, with a refuge in the far North. Bigalli therefore highlights the persistence of the debate on Atlantis even in the Modern Age, for example in an article in the *Encyclopédie* written by Edme-François Mallet (“Atlantique”, Vol. 1, 1751).

The third part of the book, “New Lost Continents”, is very short and rather facile. The presence of the lost land myth is addressed in the theories (or, according to one’s viewpoint, the ravings) of authors associated with theosophy, occultism, hermeticism (which the author handles with some familiarity and overindulgence), and also in some more contemporary racist theories, including Nazi geopolitics. Myths like that of the city of Agartha supposedly located at the earth’s core, and bizarre theories like that of the “hollow earth” are presented as well. Expanding on a topic mentioned in the second part of the book, Bigalli also introduces a specific interweave of the Atlantis and Eden myths, expressed in the mythology of the northern isle of Thule.

The book has several interesting aspects. Bigalli leads us on a voyage of discovery of the astonishing vitality of Atlantis myths across the centuries. He highlights, for instance, how the Atlantis myth survived for many centuries after the end of classical civilization. Moreover, the book is full of documented references to islands, both concrete and imaginary: besides Atlantis and Thule, many others are mentioned, from the Hy-Brasil of medieval cartography to the whale-island and Eden of Saint Brendan, from the Alcina of Ludovico Ariosto’s *Orlando Furioso* to the fabulous Antilia, not to mention the islands actually touched by Atlantic explorations. The book provides information on the cultural connotations of these islands, and on the extent to which they were the object of philosophical and theological pursuits, geopolitical and nationalistic visions, hopes, fears, and utopias.

Bigalli does not develop a specific and coherent discourse on the island nature of these special places, and after all this was not the aim of the book. Nevertheless, one can find some very short passages of the text where Bigalli’s approach to the concept of ‘islandness’ seems to emerge indirectly: for instance, where the author, dealing with the literature on Atlantic explorations, stresses the similarity between the ‘island’ and the ‘forest’ as enclosed spaces, consequently easy to think and control; or where the text mentions Bacon’s utopian *New Atlantis* as a place (an island) kept away from any possible corrupting contact with the rest of humankind, and locked in a sort of a timeless bubble; and again where Bigalli quotes historian Franz Wegener’s piece on the utopian character of Atlantis amenable to Nazism (the island as enclosed system, able to provide a geographical ground for totalitarian theories). The book seems to suggest that some cultural connotations of islands - like apartness and otherness - make these places one of most ideal milieux where human communities can project and locate their myths and symbols.

At the same time, however, the book has its flaws, some of which have already been alluded to. I may add that one feels the lack of an adequate introduction (clearly explaining the objectives, the theoretical approach, and the methodology adopted), and of a

conclusion summarizing the published work's main achievements. Consequently, several concepts appear in the book without any justification of their use (two examples: the psychoanalytic notion of "perturbant", and that of "signifier" in linguistics). Moreover, the different parts of the book appear quite disconnected as there are generally no transitions explaining the connections between one chapter and the next. To give another example of the difficulties the book presents, the last chapter of the second part of the book and the first chapter of the third part have the same title ("Atlantis in Motion"). In a book of this kind, one also feels the lack of an index of places.

All in all, regardless of any agreement one may have with the author's philosophical and cultural approach, this book provides a lot of information and hints for reflection, but it would have succeeded better with a more effective structure and more attention to the reader's needs.

Daniele Mezzana

CERFE (Centro di Ricerca e Documentazione Febbraio '74)

Rome, Italy

dmezzana@tiscali.it

Anne Brogini & Maria Ghazali (eds.) (2010) *Des Marges aux Frontières. Les Puissances en Méditerranée à l'Époque Moderne* [From Margins to Frontiers: Mediterranean Powers in the Modern Age], Paris, Classiques Garnier, 433pp. ISBN: 978-281240094-0. €59.

Des Marges aux Frontières is the product of a two-day workshop organized at the University of Nice Sophia Antipolis by Anne Brogini and Maria Ghazali in April 2008. The objective of this workshop was to study changing patterns in the perception and role of islands in the Mediterranean during the early modern period. From a fringe position in the European empires, western Mediterranean islands became focal points of the relationships between the powers of the Inner Sea.

The approaches to Mediterranean history presented in the book are enriched by the diversity of the participating scholars. While the contents of this book are mainly in French – only one article is written in English – the authors hail from all over the Mediterranean: Turkey, Tunisia, Greece, Malta, Spain, Italy, and France. In this way, the text offers a truly wide range of analyses and various points of view on the questions raised.

Brogini and Ghazali are well-known for their research on Malta, the relationships between Christians and Muslims in the Mediterranean, and Spanish civilization. They introduce this text rather briefly – in an editorial spanning just 15 pages; but they do so very thoughtfully, precisely defining the conceptual framework of the studies that follow. They first refer to the the French approach to the study of the frontier by Daniel Nordman. In this light, frontiers are lines that both unite and separate peoples, spaces, and civilizations. These lines came to be more clearly marked by fortifications built by various powers during the 16th century. In a later section, Brogini and Ghazali chose to emphasize the Anglo-Saxon

concept of frontier, as a dynamic space of commercial, cultural, and political exchange, as well as an area of religious, economic, and military conflict.

The book is divided into three sections which set forth the three main patterns in the evolution of islands as frontiers during the early modern period. The first is entitled “Défendre et se défendre” [Defence and self-defence] and is focused on the 16th century of the Great Mediterranean in the legacy of the French economic historian Fernand Braudel. Then, the Spanish and Ottoman empires were seeking to establish their dominion over the Inner Sea. Islands were places to protect, to defend, and to fight for. The articles in this section of the book discuss Djerba, Lipari, Cyprus, and Sicily, and show how insular peoples were unwittingly involved in the defence of their islands and how the central powers chose to invest in the building of fortifications, watchtowers, and castles.

The second part, “Vivre la frontière: guerres et échanges” [Living the Frontier: wars and exchanges] is focused on the 17th century, and points out how the end of direct armed conflict between the two great empires – Spanish and Ottoman – and the coming of new rivals – particularly the French and the English – in the Inner Sea produced a changing situation for the islands. From a margin to defend, islands became central to the economic, commercial, and political relationships between the Islamic and Christian worlds. And yet, as the different essays emphasize, the situation was much more complicated than a simple Manichean division between East and West, Christians and Muslims. Corsair activities show different ways of thinking about and living among the islands. Malta is a particularly clear example of an island used as an area of exchange and a melting pot of civilizations.

The third section, “Souverainetés et identités insulaires” [Sovereignties and island identities], deals with the question of sovereignty and identity in the Mediterranean islands during the late early modern period as representing the end of the change in the perception of islands as margins and frontiers. Precisely at the moment when the colonial empires were being assembled, islands became places where national identity starts to emerge. This phenomenon results from a combination of an ancient identity (born from centuries of contact, occupation and exchange with central mainland powers), and the new bureaucratic power of the distant and yet present colonial state. This, in my opinion, is the weakest part of the book, in terms of homogeneity. Perhaps this could be explained by the fact that the topic is too large and complicated to be addressed in a few essays.

All these articles are very rich in bibliographical and archival references. The resources and the archives used come from many different places, in various languages, and are of diverse genres: ranging from official, legal, and administrative documents, travel writing, merchants’ records, and architectural designs; they offer an accurate panorama of the western Mediterranean islands, and not only from a French or Western point of view. There are many long citations in original languages, and one regrets that the citations are not always translated. The methodology is consistently strong and solid, however, with an effective use of social history methods on the issues of frontiers and the perception of Mediterranean people and spaces.

Some of the essays focus much more on theory and historiography than others. For example, Natividad Planas gives a very rich reflection on the concept of island, while the article by Vergé-Franceschi is essentially descriptive. It is obvious that Braudel and his *Great Mediterranean*, and the more recent *Corrupting Sea* by P. Horden and N. Purcell, have influenced and formed the basis of most of the reflections contained in the book. Brogini and Ghazali carefully summarize the different steps in the conceptualization of frontier historiography in a rather lengthy footnote in their introduction; but the various authors cite an even more comprehensive set of references, from classics of the end of the 19th century to very recent studies. They make very good use of all this material, criticizing part of it - for example, the perception of islands in Braudel's work - and going further in other aspects, for example focusing, in this theoretical context, on the particular case of islands within social history methodology.

As usual in such a study, the book is not perfectly homogenous and evenly balanced. Some articles are longer and more descriptive than others. But, all in all, it does offer a very useful view of recent work on western Mediterranean islands and the concept of frontier, inclusive of the history of the people who animated and inhabited those spaces.

Aline Durel

Political Attaché, Corsican Assembly

Ajaccio, France

alinedurel@yahoo.fr

Godfrey Baldacchino (2010) *Island Enclaves: Offshoring Strategies, Creative Governance, and Subnational Island Jurisdictions*, Montreal and Kingston, Canada, McGill-Queen's University Press, 301pp, ISBN: 978-0-7735-3716-3 (cloth) Can\$/US\$95.00; ISBN: 978-0-7735-3743-9 (paper) Can\$/US\$32.95.

The reviewer has just finished writing a book in which the acknowledgment section runs to just over half a page. That in Godfrey Baldacchino's *Island Enclaves* stretches to over eight pages. This unusual length reveals not only the author's well-developed networking, but also identifies the strength and development of the subject of island studies with which Baldacchino, the Canada Research Chair in Island Studies at the University of Prince Edward Island, has been associated and is tribute to the number of people and institutions now working in the area.

The subjects for the book's wide range of issues are subnational island jurisdictions, ranging in scale from mighty Taiwan with its 23 million people to miniscule Pitcairn with under 50. Baldacchino starts the preface with a then contemporary situation, the fact that the regulations of the Chinese Special Administrative Region of Hong Kong facilitated that subnational jurisdiction hosting the equestrian events in the 2008 Beijing Olympics, in preference to mainland China. It ends with the example of how Prince Edward Island, population about 140,000, makes use of the unusual historical and geographical circumstances that have given it the opportunity of being a full Canadian province with the same rights and opportunities as Ontario and Québec with their populations of millions. As

Baldacchino had written earlier, any move to change this situation ‘would be aggressively contested by Prince Edward Islanders’ (p. xxvi).

In Chapter 1, Baldacchino counts 100 or more island subnational jurisdictions, place that are not states but have some governance functions greater than municipalities. This chapter demonstrates his comprehensive knowledge of islands and their activities, roles and uses throughout time and over space taking material from a variety of disciplines: natural sciences, social sciences, history, geography, literature, leading into political economy which he identifies as the focus of the rest of the volume.

In the second chapter, the author recognizes that readers might take offence at some of the places he characterises as subnational island jurisdictions, given their political status may be disputed – Taiwan is a case in point. Baldacchino adopts a pragmatic approach, simply recognising the factual situation of places operating as a separate polity. Although subnational jurisdictions are not exclusively an insular phenomenon, Baldacchino suggests a number of reasons why islands are so often in this category: being bounded, cut off, containable; with, usually, a lack of internal borders.

Another reason is explored in the following chapter, which considers decolonization. The predominance of islands in the remaining ‘empires’ has been seen as a recognition of their weaknesses and, certainly, many colonial islands have not the scale or strength to sustain the rigours of independence: the Falkland Islands, St Helena and Pitcairn would be three obvious examples from the British territories. However, in the 1980s, it was expected that at least ten then non-independent territories would progress towards full independence by the early 1990s. Mainland Namibia made it, but not the other expected candidates. The world’s most recent states came instead from the break-up of long-established, theoretically unitary polities in the Soviet Union, Yugoslavia and Czechoslovakia. Baldacchino goes through some of the candidate island territories which remain in colonial thrall: Aruba, French Polynesia, New Caledonia, Greenland, Montserrat, and he reports on another twelve islands which held various types of referenda associated with a change of governance structure, all of which decided against seeking full independence. This is ‘upside down decolonization’, as it is the metropolitan power in many cases which seeks to push the territories to independence rather than demands coming from the subject peoples. As a mark of the complicated situation regarding types of subnational jurisdictions, Baldacchino leaves from this analysis three former members of the Trust Territory of the Pacific, the Federated States of Micronesia, Marshall Islands and Palau, as they operate under Compacts of Association with the USA, which he reports as a hybrid jurisdiction short of full independence, despite membership of the UN or other marks of sovereignty. The rest of this chapter seeks to explain why places no longer seem to want what was regarded as ‘the right of the people ... to the unfettered control of [their] destinies, to be sovereign and inalienable’ to quote from the declaration made during the Easter Rising in Ireland in 1916, to be read on a plaque on the central post office in Dublin where the Rising and the deaths and executions associated with it had its focus. Rather, for today’s ‘small island jurisdictions, there is quite a compelling case to be made for autonomy without sovereignty’ (p. 64).

The fourth chapter looks at economic matters, including a full discussion on MIRAB islands. Then come the uses made by subnational jurisdictions in realms such as offshore banking and other financial instruments, access, control of people, including restricting land and property ownership, and tourism: 'distinct strands of a broad strategy for securing unorthodox economic development'. Indeed, Baldacchino comes up with his own acronym in the tradition of, but contrasting to, MIRAB. This is PROFIT: P(eople, citizenship, residence and employment rights), R(esource management), O(verseas engagement and ultra-national recognition), FI(nance), T(ourism).

The fifth chapter considers governance, with a case being made to recognize subnational jurisdictions' autonomies being 'politico-economic units in their own right, rather than insignificant relics from a bygone age' (p. 83). One of the subheadings gives credence to this: 'jurisdictional clout'. The following chapter exemplifies the relationships between some island subnational jurisdictions and their metropolitan powers and other outside actors through its consideration of 'offshoring strategies'. The seventh chapter looks at paradiplomacy, how the islands respond to opportunities in the international arena – three British Overseas Territories are members of the Organization of Eastern Caribbean States, for example, whilst the Cook Islands and Niue are members of the Pacific Islands Forum. There is a long section on the complicated nature of Taiwan's relationships with places outside at this point. The final substantive chapter considers environmental policies and politics, where the report card is, at best, mixed. However, the high proportion of island spaces protected and/or recognised as significant is noteworthy and Baldacchino presents an interesting table of island World Heritage Sites, although inclusion of large cities such as Kyoto and Edinburgh, to say nothing of the UK's Blenheim Palace, does detract from the islandness of the analysis.

Before mapping and listing his island subnational jurisdictions in an appendix and the 66 pages of notes and references (this is a very well-referenced book), Baldacchino presents a conclusion to this rich and complex volume, one that has managed to consider material at welcome depth given its range of places and issues. This summarises why island subnational jurisdictions remain in that situation: they are often wealthier than neighbouring independent nations and take advantage of the 'free-riding' available from their metropolitan powers in such matters as defence and regulation and have an ability to take advantage of their legislative separateness. There is balance here, the dilemmas in the situation are recognised: relationships between local politicians and the governor appointed to represent the metropolitan power are not always easy, as this reviewer has observed on the Turks and Caicos Islands. Further, offshore finance is not the cash cow it might once have been given changed public attitudes and stricter national and international oversight in recent years. The crash of Iceland's economy following the overextension of its banks is a moot point here and has to be recognised in Baldacchino's plea for small islands to be seen with fresh eyes: 'the belief that constraints of small size and geographical separateness render islands particularly "vulnerable" economically is both conceptually and empirically unsatisfactory, in spite of what happened to Iceland in the current global credit crunch' (p. 199). In support, the last word comes from a Guernsey man, Tony Gallienne, who wrote of his island being able to 'mine that rich seam of jurisdictional capacity to construct and exploit economic possibilities'.

The book's intention had been clearly set out in the preface: '*Island Enclaves* is offered as a global and critical enquiry into how much islands can inform us about such dynamics as the evolution of decolonization, post-colonialism, globalization, paradiplomacy, ecological development and perforated sovereignty generally' (pp. xviii-xix). Perhaps aware of the ambition of such a range of topics, Godfrey Baldacchino had then asked for our apologies 'if the book doesn't quite clinch it'. He need not have worried.

Stephen A. Royle
Queen's University Belfast
Belfast, Northern Ireland, UK
s.royle@qub.ac.uk